



## Tutorial for Cyber-Physical Systems - Discrete Models Exercise Sheet 13

### Exercise 1: Equivalence of LTL formulas

8 Points + 2 Bonus Points

Consider the following claims about equivalences of LTL formulas.

Provide a counterexample (i.e. a transition system that satisfies one of the properties and violates the other) if an equivalence does not hold.

- (a)  $\Box a \wedge \bigcirc \Diamond a \stackrel{?}{\equiv} \Box a$
- (b)  $\Diamond a \wedge \bigcirc \Box a \stackrel{?}{\equiv} \Diamond a$
- (c)  $\Box a \rightarrow \Diamond b \stackrel{?}{\equiv} a \mathbf{U} (b \vee \neg a)$
- (d)  $a \mathbf{U} \text{false} \stackrel{?}{\equiv} \Box a$
- (e)  $\Box \bigcirc b \stackrel{?}{\equiv} \Box b$

**Bonus:** If an equivalence holds, give a proof.

### Exercise 2: Positive Normal Form

4 Points

Transform the following LTL formulas into an equivalent LTL formulas in PNF.

- (a)  $\neg \left( (\Box a) \rightarrow ((a \wedge \neg c) \mathbf{U} \neg(\bigcirc b)) \right)$
- (b)  $\neg \left( \Diamond a \wedge \bigcirc (\neg(\Box b \rightarrow c)) \right)$

### Exercise 3\*: LTL Equivalence

3 Bonus Points

Let  $\varphi, \psi$  be two LTL formulas. Prove the following statement from the lecture:

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{Words}(\varphi) = \text{Words}(\psi) \\ & \text{iff} \\ & \text{for all transition systems } \mathcal{T} : \mathcal{T} \models \varphi \iff \mathcal{T} \models \psi \end{aligned}$$

**Hint:** A transition system  $\mathcal{T}$  may have infinitely many states.